



## LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

---

### VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 26

THIRD SESSION, THIRTY-NINTH LEGISLATURE

#### PRAYER

1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.

On motion of Hon. Ms. OSWALD, Bill (No. 18) – The Regulated Health Professions Act/Loi sur les professions de la santé réglementées, was read a First Time and had its purposes outlined.

---

The following petitions were presented and read:

Mr. BRIESE – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request the Minister of Infrastructure and Transportation to consider upgrading the Ring Dike Road at Ste. Rose du Lac into a Provincial Road and to consider upgrading the Ring Dike Road at the same time that work is being done at the junction of PTH 68 and PTH 5. (D. Parthenay, C. Ogg, M. Hayward and others)

Mr. DYCK – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request the Minister of Health to strongly consider giving priority for funding to develop and staff a new 100 bed long-term-care facility so that clients are not exposed to unsafe conditions and so that Boundary Trails Health Centre beds remain available for acute care patients instead of waiting placement clients. (J. Hoepfner, B. Abelson, A. Heppner and others)

Mr. SCHULER – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request that the Minister of Transportation consider the immediate installation of traffic signals at the intersection of PTH #15 and Highway #206 in Dugald and to recognize the value of the lives and well-being of the students and citizens of Manitoba. (E. Zieske, V. Anderson, M. Hadaller and others)

Mr. LAMOUREUX – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request that the Premier of Manitoba consider how important it is to have the Seven Oaks Hospital provide full emergency services seven days a week 24 hours a day. (S. Hardy, D. Fulcner, T. Daley and others)

---

Mr. DERKACH, Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Public Accounts, presented its Second Report, which was read as follows:

Your Standing Committee on Public Accounts presents the following as its Second Report.

## Meetings

Your Committee met on Wednesday, April 15, 2009 at 7:00 p.m. in Room 255 of the Legislative Building.

## Matters under Consideration

- Auditor General's Report to the Legislative Assembly – Audits of Government Operations dated December 2008: Chapter 2, Monitoring Compliance with The Ambulance Services Act
- Auditor General's Report to the Legislative Assembly – Audits of Government Operations dated December 2008: Chapter 3, Pharmacare Program – Part 2
- Auditor General's Report – Audit of the Pharmacare Program Manitoba Health – April 2006

## Committee Membership

- Mr. BOROTSIK
- Mr. DERKACH (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. DEWAR
- Ms. HOWARD (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. LAMOUREUX
- Mr. MARTINDALE
- Mr. MAGUIRE
- Hon. Mr. SELINGER
- Mrs. STEFANSON
- Mr. WHITEHEAD

## Officials Speaking on Record

- Carol Bellringer, Auditor General
- Arlene Wilgosh, Deputy Minister of Health and Healthy Living
- Hon. Ms. OSWALD

## Reports Considered and Passed

Your Committee considered and passed the following reports as presented:

- Auditor General's Report – Audit of the Pharmacare Program Manitoba Health – April 2006

**Chapters Considered and Completed**

Your Committee completed consideration of the following chapters as presented:

- Auditor General's Report to the Legislative Assembly – Audits of Government Operations dated December 2008: Chapter 2, Monitoring Compliance with The Ambulance Services Act
- Auditor General's Report to the Legislative Assembly – Audits of Government Operations dated December 2008: Chapter 3, Pharmacare Program – Part 2

On motion of Mr. DERKACH, the Report of the Committee was received.

---

Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK presented:

Supplementary Information for Legislative Review 2009-2010 – Departmental Expenditure Estimates – Justice.

(Sessional Paper No. 40)

---

Hon. Ms. WOWCHUK presented:

Supplementary Information for Legislative Review 2009-2010 – Departmental Expenditure Estimates – Agriculture and Food and Rural Initiatives.

(Sessional Paper No. 41)

---

Hon. Mr. ASHTON, the Minister responsible for Emergency Measures, made a statement regarding the flood conditions throughout the Province of Manitoba,

Mr. BRIESE and, by leave, Hon. Mr. GERRARD commented on the statement.

---

Pursuant to Rule 26(1), Messrs. NEVAKSHONOFF and FAURSCHOU, Ms. SELBY, Mrs. TAILLIEU and Mr. MARTINDALE made Members' Statements.

---

In accordance with Rule 31(9), the Opposition House Leader announced that the Manitoba's Growing Debt is a Worrisome Liability Resolution will be considered next Thursday, April 23, 2009.

---

The House resumed the Interrupted Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mr. SELINGER:

THAT this House approves in general the budgetary policy of the government.

And the proposed amendment moved by Mr. MCFADYEN as follows:

*That the Motion be amended by deleting all the words after “House” and substituting:*

therefore regrets that this budget fails to address the priorities of Manitobans by:

(a) increasing our province’s debt to an all time high of \$21.1 billion, which creates a credit card bill of \$18,380, for every man, woman and child in the province. Hard working Manitoba families will be forced to pay off this bill in the months and years ahead; and

(b) gambling with incomes and social programs by increasing our dependence on Ottawa handouts to a record level of \$3.8 billion, more than double the handouts we received in 1999, which is like a family with a \$60,000 income relying on neighbours for \$22,000 a year, when those neighbours are now in serious financial trouble; and

(c) running a deficit, and misleadingly calling it a surplus, by using the misleading accounting practise of calling Crown income “revenue” when in fact that income is not available to government because it is required to meet obligations such as Manitoba Hydro’s record \$7.4 billion long-term debt; and

(d) attempting to introduce a new misleading accounting practise with a proposal to reduce by over 80 percent the minimum payment on Manitoba’s credit card debt, taking that repayment to \$17.54 per person this year on a bill of \$18,380; and

(e) failing to announce a plan to tackle corruption, waste and mismanagement within government by:

(i) endorsing the Winnipeg Regional Health Authority “brown envelope” tendering scheme; and

(ii) failing to repeal the “vote tax,” leaving the New Democratic Party in line to pocket one million dollars over four years at the expense of Manitoba taxpayers; and

(iii) failing to cancel the reckless and environmentally harmful west side BiPole III project and instead proceed with the east side line, which is supported by the vast majority; would protect the Boreal forest; would protect the Riding Mountain UNESCO biosphere reserve, provide a far more reliable back up to BiPole I and II; save forty megawatts of line loss which will allow for the closure of a coal-fired power plant and save Manitoba Hydro ratepayers a minimum of \$640 million or \$2,000 for every family in the province; and

(f) failing to offer a plan to create opportunity and wealth, so Manitobans can feel hope that we will one day emerge from the hole of debt and dependency and see a brighter future.

As a consequence, the government has thereby lost the confidence of this House and the people of Manitoba.

And the proposed sub-amendment moved by Hon. Mr. GERRARD as follows:

*THAT the amendment be amended by adding thereto the following words:*

And further regrets that this budget fails to address the priorities of Manitobans by:

- (g) failure to put patients first by continuing to base RHA spending on global budgets rather than services delivered; and
- (h) failure to provide full emergency services at our community hospitals, including Seven Oaks; and
- (i) failure to account for the health care costs of the diabetes epidemic; and
- (j) neglecting the need to address the diabetes epidemic facing Manitoba; and
- (k) failure to consider historical recession data from the 1990s in projecting corporation income tax levels; and
- (l) continuing to ignore the need to set targets for cleaning up Lake Winnipeg and other Manitoba lakes suffering from toxic alga blooms; and
- (m) failure to address climate change by running a carbon-neutral government; and
- (n) failing to mention rapid transit in the budget speech; and
- (o) failure to implement a plan to reduce child poverty rates in Manitoba; and
- (p) failing to create an adequate action plan and funding for early childhood education in Manitoba; and
- (q) failure to support the agricultural sector by refusing to fund eco-friendly farming practices such as a province-wide ALUS program and;
- (r) refusing to acknowledge the damage the payroll tax has on economic growth; and
- (s) failure to act on economic development for First Nations and rural Manitobans; and
- (t) failure to support reductions in wait times for post-secondary institutions; and
- (u) failure to recognize the need for, and address the establishment of, a Manitoba Science, Engineering and Humanities Research Council; and
- (v) failure to address Northern Manitoba housing issues;

And the debate continuing on the sub-amendment,

And Mrs. TAILLIEU, Hon. Ms. ALLAN, Mr. SCHULER, Hon. Mr. DOER, Mr. BOROTSIK and Hon. Mr. SELINGER having spoken.

And the Question being put on the sub-amendment. It was negatived, on the following division:

**YEA**

BOROTSIK	HAWRANIK
BRIESE	LAMOUREUX
CULLEN	MAGUIRE
DRIEDGER	MCFADYEN
DYCK	MITCHELSON
EICHLER	PEDERSEN
FAURSCHOU	ROWAT
GERRARD	SCHULER
GOERTZEN	STEFANSON
GRAYDON	TAILLIEU..... 20

**NAY**

ALLAN	MACKINTOSH
ALTEMEYER	MARCELINO
ASHTON	MARTINDALE
BLADY	MCGIFFORD
BLAIKIE	MELNICK
BJORNSON	NEVAKSHONOFF
BRAUN	OSWALD
BRICK	REID
CALDWELL	ROBINSON
CHOMIAK	RONDEAU
DEWAR	SARAN
DOER	SELBY
HOWARD	SELINGER
IRVIN-ROSS	STRUTHERS
JENNISSON	SWAN
JHA	WHITEHEAD
KORZENIOWSKI	WOWCHUK..... 35
LEMIEUX	

And the Question being put on the amendment. It was negatived, on the following division:

**YEA**

BOROTSIK	HAWRANIK
BRIESE	LAMOUREUX
CULLEN	MAGUIRE
DRIEDGER	MCFADYEN
DYCK	MITCHELSON
EICHLER	PEDERSEN
FAURSCHOU	ROWAT
GERRARD	SCHULER
GOERTZEN	STEFANSON
GRAYDON	TAILLIEU.....20

**NAY**

ALLAN	MACKINTOSH
ALTEMEYER	MARCELINO
ASHTON	MARTINDALE
BLADY	MCGIFFORD
BLAIKIE	MELNICK
BJORNSON	NEVAKSHONOFF
BRAUN	OSWALD
BRICK	REID
CALDWELL	ROBINSON
CHOMIAK	RONDEAU
DEWAR	SARAN
DOER	SELBY
HOWARD	SELINGER
IRVIN-ROSS	STRUTHERS
JENNISSEN	SWAN
JHA	WHITEHEAD
KORZENIOWSKI	WOWCHUK.....35
LEMIEUX	

And the Question being put on the main motion. It was agreed to, on the following division:

**YEA**

ALLAN	MACKINTOSH
ALTEMEYER	MARCELINO
ASHTON	MARTINDALE
BLADY	MCGIFFORD
BLAIKIE	MELNICK
BJORNSON	NEVAKSHONOFF
BRAUN	OSWALD
BRICK	REID
CALDWELL	ROBINSON
CHOMIAK	RONDEAU
DEWAR	SARAN
DOER	SELBY
HOWARD	SELINGER
IRVIN-ROSS	STRUTHERS
JENNISSSEN	SWAN
JHA	WHITEHEAD
KORZENIOWSKI	WOWCHUK..... 35
LEMIEUX	

**NAY**

BOROTSIK	HAWRANIK
BRIESE	LAMOUREUX
CULLEN	MAGUIRE
DRIEDGER	MCFADYEN
DYCK	MITCHELSON
EICHLER	PEDERSEN
FAURSCHOU	ROWAT
GERRARD	SCHULER
GOERTZEN	STEFANSON
GRAYDON	TAILLIEU..... 20

---

The House then adjourned at 4:43 p.m. until 1:30 p.m., Monday, April 20, 2009.

Hon. George HICKES,  
Speaker.