

## PRAYERS

## 1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.

Immediately following Prayers, Mr. MAGUIRE rose on a matter of privilege and moved:

THAT this House censure the Premier for his contemptuous actions in knowingly placing misleading information before this House which was not accurate or based upon information already tabled in this Assembly by his own Finance Minister; and

THAT the Premier be directed to apologize to the Legislative Assembly and the people of Manitoba for bringing such false information before this House and undermining the integrity and respect of this House.

And Hon. Mr. MACKINTOSH having spoken,

WHEREUPON Mr. Speaker informed the House he would take the matter under advisement.

Hon. Mr. SMITH (Brandon West) presented:

Manitoba Lotteries Corporation, Quarterly Report, Six Months, April 1, 2002 to September 30, 2002.

(Sessional Paper No. 16)

By leave, Mr. HAWRANIK introduced Bill (No. 201) – The Criminal Organizations Deterrence Act (Local Government Acts Amended)/Loi visant à prévenir les activités des gangs (modification de lois concernant certaines administrations locales), and outlined the purposes thereof, it was read a First Time.

Following Oral Questions, Mr. Speaker made the following ruling:

During Oral Questions on December 2, 2002, the Honourable Official Opposition House Leader raised a point of order regarding comments allegedly spoken by the Honourable Minister of Agriculture and Food from her seat. The Honourable Official Opposition House Leader stated that the Honourable Minister had said from her seat the words "liar, liar" that were directed towards the Honourable Member for Russell. I took the matter under advisement in order to peruse Hansard.

I thank the Honourable Official Opposition House Leader for his contribution. I have read the exchange on page 103 of Hansard where the words were allegedly spoken, and Hansard does not contain a record of the words "liar, liar" being spoken. I must therefore rule that there is no point of order. I would like to note for the House when the point of order was raised, there was much disorder, and that perhaps this was not our finest display of decorum.

Pursuant to Rule 23(1), Mr. NEVAKSHONOFF, Mrs. DRIEDGER, Messrs. MARTINDALE and PENNER (Emerson) and Ms. ASPER made Members' Statements.

The House resumed the Interrupted Debate on the Proposed Motion of Mr. DEWAR:

THAT the following address be presented to His Honour the Lieutenant Governor:

We, the Members of the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba thank your Honour for the gracious speech addressed to us at this Fourth Session of the Thirty-Seventh Legislature of Manitoba.

And the proposed amendment moved by Mr. MURRAY as follows:

*That the Motion be amended by adding at the end of the sentence the following words:* 

But this House regrets

(a) the government's inability to fulfill the promises outlined in its Throne Speech of November 13, 2001, including the following failures: not ending hallway medicine; not addressing the province-wide shortage of health care professionals; not reducing waiting lists for health care services; and

(b) the government's failure to address Manitoba's growing court backlogs through such measures as contracting with private law firms; and

(c) the government's failure to make a commitment for further provincial income tax reductions; and

(d) the government's failure to institute mandatory standards testing in grades 6 and Senior 1 despite the fact that our students score lower on national testing than the Canadian average; and

(e) the government's failure to make a firm commitment to relocating Assiniboine Community College to the former Brandon Mental Health Centre site; and

(f) the government's failure to ensure a viable future for the family farm in Manitoba through measures such as providing the provincial government's share of the transition funding set out in the Agricultural Policy Framework, thereby not addressing the pressing challenges facing Manitoba producers and treating them as 40 per cent less valuable than their counterparts in Alberta and Ontario; and

(g) the government's failure to adequately promote rural economic diversification; and

(h) the government's failure to prevent Manitoba parks from being carved up and protected for future generations, in spite of the fact that the Member for Concordia told a Winnipeg radio station that "the designation (of a provincial park) means the public owns the park and it can't be sold or bartered away..."; and

(i) the government's failure to set out a meaningful plan to protect the province's fish stocks from illegal fishing; and

(j) the government's failure to set out a plan to prevent future spills of sewage into the Red River; and

(k) the government's failure to provide a cost-benefit analysis of the impact of ratifying the Kyoto Protocol on Manitoba's economy; and

(1) the government's failure to stem the outflow of Manitobans to other provinces; and

(m) the government's failure to recognize the important role private sector involvement has in growing Manitoba's economy.

AND has thereby lost the trust and confidence of the people of Manitoba and this House.

And the debate continuing on the amendment,

And leave having been denied to have the matter remain in the name of Hon. Mr. ASHTON,

And Messrs. PITURA, JENNISSEN, ENNS, MALOWAY and TWEED having spoken,

And Hon. Ms. WOWCHUK speaking at 6:00 p.m. The debate was allowed to remain in her name.

The House then adjourned at 6:00 p.m. until 10:00 a.m. Friday, December 6, 2002.

Hon. George HICKES, Speaker.